Martin M. Lintner (ed.)

GOD IN QUESTION RELIGIOUS LANGUAGE AND SECULAR LANGUAGES

with a Foreword by Peter Hünermann



On the occasion of the 25th anniversary of the

EUROPEAN SOCIETY FOR CATHOLIC THEOLOGY

(1989-2014)

to its former Presidents

Peter HÜNERMANN

Tübingen, Germany (1989–1995)

Honorary President

Hans VAN DER VEN

Nijmegen, Netherlands (1995–1998)

Gerhard LARCHER

Graz, Austria (1998–2001)

Leo KARRER

Fribourg, Switzerland (2001–2004)

Lieven BOEVE

Leuven, Belgium (2005–2009)

Eamonn CONWAY

Limerick, Ireland (2009–2011)

Sigrid MÜLLER

Wien, Austria (2011–2013)



Contents

Foreword Peter Hünermann	13
Introduction Martin M. Lintner	15
Speaking about God – Biblical Sources	
Impulse alttestamentlicher Gottesrede für die religiöse Sprache heute Arnold Stiglmair	21
La novità del linguaggio evangelico: Gesù, il volto umano di Dio Ricardo M. Pérez Márquez	37
"Was ihr verehrt, ohne es zu kennen, verkünde ich euch." (Apg 17,23) Der lukanische Paulus in Athen als Beispiel für Verkündigung im "paganen" Umfeld	
Veronika Burz-Tropper	47
Lying Dominik Opatrný	59
Linguaggio "profano" per descrivere la "politica" di Dio: il caso specifico delle parabole di Gesù Steven Senaldi	69
Sieven Senaiai	09
Theology and Philosophy in Dialogue	
Die Sprache der Moral und die Sprache der Religion – Kants Religionsschrift als Beispiel eines Übersetzungsprozesses Margit Wasmaier-Sailer	83
Sprechen über Gott im Dialog mit Agnostikern. Ein philosophischer Beitrag Markus Moling	95
Ohne Fundamentalismus und ohne Platonismus: Christliche Praxis als säkulare Sprache von Gott	
Paul Weß	101

Speaking about God in a secular Context

La fede e il dialogo con i non credenti Bruno Forte	117
Sprechen von Gott und Schweigen von Gott – Konflikt oder Kompatibilität? Tomáš Halík	129
Dire la "compassione" di Dio Antonio Ascione	137
Pilgern mit Agnostikern? Erkundungen zur säkularen Bedeutung des Evangeliums <i>Christian Bauer</i>	151
Religion als Suchsprache. Mehrsprachiger Religionsunterricht als religions- pädagogische Lernchance Christian Cebulj	165
Narrative Theologie im Dialog mit dem Indifferentismus **Konrad Glombik*** **Theologie im Dialog mit dem Indifferentismus** **Konrad Glombik*** **Theologie im Dialog mit dem Indifferentismus** **Theolog mit dem Indifferentismus** **Theologie im Dialog mit dem Indifferentismus** **Theolog mit dem Indifferen	177
Religious Language in "Other" Places. Cano's <i>De Locis Theologicis</i> – a Case Study in Mapping the Religious and the Secular <i>Judith Gruber</i>	189
Zum Dialog mit den "religiös Unerreichbaren" Michal Kaplánek	203
Religion als leerer Signifikant in Ostmitteleuropa András Máté-Tóth	211
Turista e/o pellegrino? Una questione di fede nel contesto dei viaggi odierni Mirosław Mejzner	225
Secolarizzazione e desiderio di Dio Leonardo Paris	235
Fede, credenza e identità in questione Davide Zordan	247
God-talk Today: Challenges for Theology and the Church	
(Vor-)Überlegungen zu einer Theologie, die an der Zeit ist Christoph J. Amor	263

Situations nouvelles de l'évangélisation : Présence du religieux dans nos sociétés	
Paul Valadier	283
Horror Vacui: God and Evil in/after Auschwitz Didier Pollefeyt	293
Gotteskrise statt Kirchenkrise – eine Fehldiagnose als Argument? Marianne Heimbach-Steins / Georg Steins	303
I problemi d'inculturazione del vangelo nella cultura postmoderna Eduard Krumpolc	315
Gottesrede und die Fallen der Evangelisierung Willibald Sandler	323
Unumgänglichkeit der Säkularisierung und Ablehnung des Säkularismus in der heutigen postmodernen Gesellschaft Inocent-Mária V. Szaniszló	339
Theologische Vermittlung in der Spannung zwischen Lehramt, Forschung und pastoraler Praxis am Beispiel der Moraltheologie Claudia Mariéle Wulf	
How to speak about God: A Search for Traces in Ritual, Poetry and Literature	
Le langage rituel et le langage théologique Ângelo Cardita	365
A mystical Experience of Absence: A Theological Reflection on the Poetry of Daniel Faria José Pedro Angélico	379
La teopoetica di Rubem Alves Marco dal Corso	387
"Gottes Ursprache". Hugo Ball's Theology of Sound Frank G. Bosman	397
Vielleicht ganz unreligiös. Bemerkungen zur Sprache des Glaubens im Zeitalter der Naturwissenschaften Elisabeth Pernkopf	413
- IJ	0

Religious Language and Public Spaces: Modern Arts, Architecture and Media

Aspetti del religioso in alcuni esempi di arte contemporanea: un linguaggio per la ricerca del terribilmente umano? Letizia Ragaglia	425
Aura / Atmosphäre / Präsenz – Sprachen religiöser und architektonischer Wirkungsintensitäten Nadine Haepke	439
Die Herrschaft des Kein. Warum ist kirchliche Sprache so negativ? Christiane Florin	457
"I Call You (Facebook) Friends": New Media and the New Evangelization Stephen Bullivant	471
Theology, Church and Politics	
Politische Mitwirkung der Kirchen in der Europäischen Union – Chancen und Grenzen aus Sicht der Politik Franz Fischler	487
Politische Mitwirkung der Kirchen in der Europäischen Union – Chancen und Grenzen aus Sicht der katholischen Kirche Michael Kuhn	493
Varia	
Buddha e il linguaggio mistico del non detto Salvatore Giuliano	507
The Virtues of sympathetic Humour in the Languages of ancient, patristic and modern Christianity Claudiu T. Arieşan	521
The Explication of religious Knowledge From religious Language to secular Language Marcel S. Bodea	531

Contents	II
List of Contributors	547
List of Abbreviations	551
General Abbreviations	551
Documents of the Magisterium	552

Foreword*

Peter Hünermann

The European Society for Catholic Theology celebrates 25 years of its existence this year. The Society was founded in Mainz on 1st/2nd December 1989, a few days after the fall of the Berlin Wall and before the dissolution of the German Democratic Republic.

It is for this reason that the president of the European Society, Martin M. Lintner has asked me to write the foreword to this volume, which contains the weighty presentations from the Congress "God in Question – Religious Language and Secular Languages," held in Brixen from 29th August through 1st September 2013. The Society presents itself and its work through this publication, which is dedicated to "*Theo-logein*," and through the corresponding edition of the journal ET-Studies 5 (2014), issue 2, which has defined the changing landscape of Catholic theology in Europe over the past 25 years.

Theo-logein, or God-speech, does not exist in only one form. It bears its own character in preaching, catechetical instruction, in the liturgical celebration, in the magisterial proclamation, which differs from the *Theo-logein* of theologians, or rather, from the science of theology. The *Theo-logein* in preaching, catechism, liturgy, magisterial proclamation is a confessing, witnessing speech. It is a God-speech, which in its credibility and identification directly involves the speaker with his/her faith, just as it engages the "we" of the faithful in Christ and speaks to listeners and addressees in their individuality. It is a speech of faith, hope and love and as such it is not a speech about God and his salvation but a *Theo-logein*, in which God and his salvation are referenced as the One who empowers, creates memories, and sends out people: ἐκ πίστεως εἰς πίστιν (ek pisteos eis pistin) (Rom 1:17).

This directly witnessing speech, however, has needed since the Middle Ages – and now needs again with a completely different urgency in our time – the *Theologein* of theologians.

At the beginning of the Middle Ages evangelisation was not understood anymore in the way it had developed in Patristics, in the sapientia christiana. Many unsettling questions remained unanswered; particularly in an epochal development over and above the standards of knowledge in the liberal arts, Aristotelian philosophy and Platonic-Neoplatonic ideas were embraced in the monasteries, cathedral schools and in the emerging universities of Europe.

^{*} Translated from German by Angela Ilić.

14 Peter Hünermann

The great theologians of the Middle Ages successfully incorporated the new basic concepts and forms of thought gathered within philosophy into an interpretation of the legacy of faith that was comprehensible. In this way, they facilitated God-speech, the first form of *Theo-logein* and a corresponding "speech about God" – which is also about humans and the world – in the public space of the universities and in the educational world at the time.

I experienced profound joy in Brixen upon seeing how younger and older theologians from East and West, from diverse cultures and environments worked and reflected together. Their goal was to mediate an up-to-date, witnessing God-speech through the numerous established and institutionally anchored languages that belong to our modern secular world and in their diversity contain approaches to the highly complex correlations that make up our global world.

Through this, the theologians do not simply render service to a small sector of social life in a widely secular education-oriented society. They do not help only those who witness to their faith in God directly through confessing and who – in the absence of theology – can do this only through words, which, based on their traditional definition and conventional overtones do not allow the personal credibility of the speaker and the credibility of their message to come to expression anymore and with that, are unable to meet the audience where they are. Through its focus, the theology of our time rather keeps the possibility altogether open for people to come to faith in God. Through that, it offers at the same time room for thoughtful people and for the sciences to critically reflect upon their respective methodological limitations and profiles and to responsibly make fitting and sensible decisions that rise above meta-languages and special languages, without being subject to narrowing constraints.

I think that the present volume and the contributions within clearly demonstrate how theologians at the forum of the European Society for Catholic Theology are striving in ingenious ways to fulfil their essential task, which is to serve theology.

Deo gratias!

15

Introduction

Martin M. Lintner

The ESCT – European Society for Catholic Theology has established itself as a significant association in the European theological landscape. Over 850 theologians, men and women, are involved in it in twenty-one national sections: from Great Britain in the north to Malta in the south, from Lithuania in the north-east and Ukraine in the east to Portugal in the west. ESCT is the only theological organisation within Europe that through its members covers the full breadth of theological disciplines and areas of investigation and yet emphasizes theology in all its variety as a unity. For many theologians spread across various countries and generations, the many and varied activities of ESCT provide an indispensable forum for academic theological exchange and personal encounter.

ESCT has now held nine international congresses. These have been at Stuttgart (1992), Freising (1995), Nijmegen (1998), Graz and Maribor (2001), Fribourg and Geneva (2004), Leuven (2007), Limerick (2009), Vienna (2011) and Brixen/Bressanone (2013). The present publication contains the papers of the last Congress, which was attended by 220 theologians from 27 European countries.

The Congress focused on the dialogue in Europe between believers, searchers, and unbelievers. With the theme "God in Question: Religious Language and Secular Languages", the participants faced the challenge of how we can as Theologians and as Church members speak about God so that the message of Jesus Christ can be made intelligible and attractive to people today, and so play a positive part in the social, cultural and political shape of Europe. The wider context of these discussions is today's Europe, often portrayed as a secular continent. In many ways secularization and religious indifference characterise public life. Many people understand themselves to be "religiously unmusical" (Jürgen Habermas), and in some places we encounter new and striking forms of atheism, which are often shaped by the natural sciences. At the same time we also observe signs of a "return to religion". Many people set out on a deliberate search for spiritual meaning and engage seriously with religious traditions. In European society we more and more hear every day of religions other than Christianity and questions are raised in the public sphere about the meaning of religion.

The opening paper for setting the context was given by Archbishop Bruno Forte. The other main papers were given by Stephen Bullivant, Franz Fischler, Christiane Florin, Tomáš Halik, Michael Kuhn, Ricardo M. Pérez Márquez OSM, Didier Pollefeyt, Letizia Ragaglia, Arnold Stiglmair and Paul Valadier SJ. The paper of

¹ An excellent insight into the history, activities of and present challenges for ESCT can be found in the journal ET-STUDIES 5 (2014), issue 2.

Christoph Amor served as the opener for the Junior Conference, which took place on 28 August and was attended by 24 doctoral and post-doctoral students from different European Catholic Theological Faculties and Universities. The Junior Conference offered these junior scholars the opportunity to present their research projects and to enter into discussion with colleagues from other countries.

All the other contributions in this book are papers given by their authors during the parallel sessions. Only papers on the theme of the Congress were selected for this publication. The quite large number of contributions is due to the aim to offer especially to emerging scholars the possibility to make themselves known to a wider public at an international level.

Altogether there are some very varied contributions. Most are in the form of short academic papers but some are presented in the style of an essay. The contributions give a lively insight into the "theological state of play" within Europe. Established as well as emerging and young scholars reflect together on the challenges for God-talk in our time. So, not only is it clear where their personal research interests lie, but also which issues are being discussed in different countries and regions in Europe and from which perspectives. The chosen approaches are also a mirror image of what is on each individual person's mind and what also preoccupies them in the social and ecclesial context in which they work.

Most of the authors are theologians but there are also representatives from the fields of religious studies, philosophy, modern art, literature, architecture, journalism, and politics. One of the purposes of the Congress was to bring these different areas together in conversation. It was in the first place through this interdisciplinary exchange that one could listen to another discipline and learn from it. In the foreground, alongside the question of what representatives of one discipline have to say to other disciplines, was the concern to learn what different disciplines are saying about humanity and how they deal with human experiences. This begs the question how they are able to influence how speech about God must be shaped so that it can enter the joys and hopes but also the cares and needs of people today. Otherwise all talk about God runs the danger of being sterile and without relevance to real life. In the light of God's revelation in the Bible, which has been slotted into human history – in an unsurpassable manner in the incarnation of the Word of God in Jesus Christ – such irrelevance of God-talk has been ruled out.

To avoid spreading the boundary of this introduction, we will dispense with an overview of the content of each individual contribution as there are so many. The reader will get a good overview for him(her)self by looking at the order of the contributions in each chapter, and the abstracts will help. The volume uses four languages; the original English, German, French and Italian have been retained for publication. To make orientation and reading easier, each contribution is preceded by an abstract in the other languages.

Acknowledgments

A heartfelt thanks are due to all who have worked on the production of this publication. For translations and the correction of texts, a special thanks to Paola Cecarini Bayer, Odile Flichy, Emmanuelle Brouette-Ruedl and Geoffrey Turner, also to Jörg Ernesti, Ulrich Fistill, Judith Gruber, Angela Ilić, Brunhilde Steger, John Pawlikowski and many others. Thanks also to the sponsors of the Congress: the Autonomous Region of Trentino-Südtirol, the Autonomous Province of Bozen-Südtirol, the Stiftung Sparkasse (Bank) in Südtirol, the city community of Brixen and many others. We are grateful to Renovabis, the action group for the solidarity of German Catholics with people from Central and Eastern Europe, have supported many participants financially from Central and East European countries.

Not least I would like to thank Professor Peter Hünermann, founding member, the first President and now Honorary President of ESCT, for the Foreword.

LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

- AMOR, Christoph J. (* 1979): Dr., Professor of Dogmatic Theology at the *Philoso-phisch-Theologische Hochschule* in Brixen/Bressanone (I)
- ANGÉLICO, José Pedro (* 1983): Dr., Lecturer in Fundamental Theology at the Catholic University of Portugal, Porto Regional Centre (PT)
- ARIEŞAN, Claudiu Teodor (* 1963): Dr., Associate Professor of Latin, Patristics and Classical Philology at the Faculty of Letters, History and Theology at the University of Timişoara (RO)
- ASCIONE, Antonio (* 1962): Dott., Extraordinary Professor of Theology and Contemporary Philosophy at the Pontifical Theological Faculty of South Italy, Section *S. Tommaso*; teaching also at the *Istituto Superiore di Scienze Religiose* "Donnaregina" in Napoli (I)
- BAUER, Christian (* 1973): Dr., originally from Germany, Professor of Pastoral Theology (specialist field: Intercultural Pastoral Theology) at the Theological Faculty of the University of Innsbruck (A)
- BODEA, Marcel S. (* 1955): Dr., Lecturer in Philosophy at the *Babeş-Bolyai* University Cluj-Napoca, Department of Philosophy (RO)
- BOSMAN, Frank G. (* 1978): Dr., Faculty member of the Tilburg School of Catholic Theology (NL)
- BULLIVANT, Stephen (* 1984): Dr., Senior Lecturer in Theology and Ethics at St. Mary's University, Twickenham (GB)
- BURZ-TROPPER, Veronika (* 1984): Dr., former University Assistant at the Biblical Research Institute of the Catholic Theological Faculty at the University of Innsbruck; Manager of the *Hertha-Firnberg-Programm*, Vienna (A)
- CARDITA, Ângelo (* 1974): Dr., originally from Portugal, Adjunct Professor of Liturgy at the Faculty of Theology and Religious Sciences at the University of Laval (CA)
- CEBULJ, Christian (* 1964): Dr., Professor of religious education and catechetics at the Chur University of Theology and in the Educational College Graubünden (CH)
- DAL CORSO, Marco (* 1963); Dott.; Lecturer at the *Istituto di Studi Ecumenici di San Bernardino di Venezia*; Journalist (rivista CEM mondialità) and Chief Editor of the *collana "Frontiere" di Pazzini editore* (I)
- FISCHLER, Franz (* 1946): Dr., former EU Agriculture Commissioner (1995–2004); President of the European Forum Alpbach, Vienna (A)
- FLORIN, Christiane (* 1968): Dr., Journalist (Chief Editor of *Christ & Welt*, supplement of *Die Zeit*) and Lecturer in Political Sciences at the University of Bonn (D)

- FORTE, Bruno (* 1949): ThD e PhD, Archbishop of Chieti-Vasti (I) since 2004; former Professor of Dogmatic Theology at the Theological Faculty of Southern Italy; member of the Pontifical Council for the New Evangelisation
- GLOMBIK, Konrad (* 1970): Dr., Professor of Moral Theology and Spirituality at the Opole University Faculty of Theology (PL)
- GRUBER, Judith (* 1982): Dr., originally from Austria, Assistant Professor of Systematic Theology, Department of Religious Studies at Loyola University New Orleans (USA)
- GIULIANO, Salvatore (* 1974): Dott., former Lecturer in the Master's Degree course "Religioni, Chiesa ed ecumenismo" at the Ateneo Pontificio "Regina Apostolorum" in Rome (I)
- HALÍK, Tomáš (* 1948): PhD DD, Professor of Sociology and Philosophy of Religion at the Faculty of Arts (Department of Religious studies) at Charles University, Prague; President of the Czech Christian Academy; former Visiting Professor at Oxford University, Cambridge University and Harvard University (CZ)
- HAEPKE, Nadine (* 1976), Dr.-Ing; Lecturer at the *Zentrale Einrichtung für Weiter-bildung* (ZEW) at the Leibniz University of Hanover (D)
- HEIMBACH-STEINS, Marianne (* 1959): Dr., Director of the Institute of Christian Social Ethics at the Catholic Theological Faculty of the University of Münster (D)
- HÜNERMANN, Peter (* 1929): Dr. Dr. h. c. mult., Emeritus Professor of Dogmatic Theology at the Catholic Theological Faculty of the University of Tübingen (D); Founding President (1989–1995) and Honorary President (since 1995) of the European Society for Catholic Theology
- KAPLANEK SDB, Michal (* 1962): ThD, Professor of Pastoral Theology at Faculty of Theology of the University of South Bohemia in České Budějovice (CZ)
- KRUMPOLC, Eduard (* 1943): Dr., Professor of Fundamental Theology at the St. Cyril and Methodius Theological Faculty of the Palacký University in Olomouc (CZ)
- KUHN, Michael (* 1958): Dr., originally from Austria, Member of the Secretariat of COMECE (Commission of the Bishops' Conferences of the European Community), Brussels (B)
- MÁTÉ-TÓTH, András (* 1957): DDr., Professor of the Study of Religions at the Deptartment for the Study of Religions, Faculty of Arts, at the University of Szeged (HU)
- MEJZNER SAC, Mirosław (* 1972): Dr., former Chief Editor of the journal "Miejsca Swiete" (Sacred Sites); Lecturer in Patrology and Religious Tourism at the Department of Theology, Institute of Patrology of the Cardinal Stefan Wyszyński University, Warsaw; Dean of Studies at the Major Seminary of the Societas Apostolatus Catholici in Poland (PL)

- MOLING, Markus (* 1978): Dr., Professor of Christian Philosophy at the *Philosophisch-Theologische Hochschule* in Brixen/Bressanone (I)
- OPATRNÝ, Dominik (* 1980): ThD, Assistant Professor of Theological Ethics at the Sts Cyril and Methodius Theological Faculty at the Palacký University, Olomouc (CZ)
- PARIS, Leonardo (* 1977): Dott.; Lecturer in Dogmatic Theology at the *Istituti di Scienze Religiose* of Belluno and Bolzano and of the Psychology of Religion at the *Studio Teologico Accademico* and at the *Corso Superiore di Scienze Religiose* in Trento (I)
- PÉREZ MÁRQUEZ OSM, Ricardo M. (* 1958): Dott., originally from Spain, Lecturer in Holy Scripture at the Servite Order's Pontifical Theological Faculty *Marianum* in Rome (I)
- PERNKOPF, Elisabeth (* 1971), Dipl.-Ing. Dr.; University Assistant at the Institute of Philosophy of the Catholic Faculty at the University of Graz (A)
- POLLEFEYT, Didier (* 1965): Dr., Vice-president for Educational Policy at the Catholic University of Leuven and Professor of Religious Education, the Theology of Jewish-Christian Relations and Post-Holocaust Theology at the Faculty of Theology and Religious Studies of the Catholic University of Leuven; Chair of the Centre for Academic Teacher-Training in Religion and Director of the Centre for Peace Ethics (Faculty of Theology and Religious Studies) at the Catholic University of Leuven (B)
- RAGAGLIA, Letizia (* 1969): Dott.ssa, Director of MUSEION (contemporary art museum), Bolzano (I)
- SANDLER, Willibald (* 1962): Dr., Extraordinary Professor of Dogmatic Theology, Institute for Systematic Theology, at the Catholic Theological Faculty of the University of Innsbruck (A)
- SENALDI C.S.S., Stefano (* 1963): Lic.; former Lecturer in Holy Scripture at the National Seminaries of Pretoria (South Africa) and Harare (Zimbabwe); Lecturer at the *Scuola Inter-diocesana di Formazione Teologica* in Bassano del Grappa and San Bonifacio; Cooperator of the *Settore Apostolato Biblico* of the Diocese of Verona (I)
- STEINS, Georg (* 1959): Dr., Professor of Old Testament at the Institute for Catholic Theology of the University of Osnabrück (D)
- STIGLMAIR, Arnold (* 1943): Dr., Emeritus Professor of Old Testament at the *Philosophisch-Theologische Hochschule* in Brixen/Bressanone (I)
- SZANISZLÓ OP, Inocent-Mária V. (* 1962): PhD Ing., Lecturer in Systematic Theology at the Theological Faculty of the Catholic University of Ružomberok, Košice (SK)
- VALADIER SJ, Paul (* 1933): DDr., Emeritus Professor of Moral and Political Philosophy at the Jesuit Faculty of Theology *Centre Sèvres* in Paris; former Professor at the Catholic University of Lyon (FR)

- WASMAIER-SAILER, Margit (* 1975): Dr., Research Associate at the Cluster of Excellence "Religion and Politics" in the University of Münster (D)
- WULF, Claudia Mariéle (* 1962): DDr., originally from Switzerland, Associated Professor in Moral Theology / Christian Ethics at the Tilburg School of Catholic Theology, Department of Systematic Theology and Philosophy, Tilburg University (NL), and Pastoral Consultant in St. Gallen (CH)
- WESS, Paul (* 1936): DDr., former Visiting Professor at Graz (A) and Würzburg (D); Lecturer in Pastoral Theology at the Catholic Theological Faculty of the University of Innsbruck (A)
- ZORDAN, Davide (* 1968): Dott., Professor of Fundamental Theology at the *Centro per le Scienze Religiose della Fondazione Bruno Kessler* in Trento (I)